

# Policy Journal of Social Science Review



## Teaching Translating of Poetry: A Collaborative Approach

Sundas Shabeer<sup>1</sup>  
Zohaib ur Rehman<sup>2</sup>  
Muhammad Idrees<sup>3</sup>

## Teaching Translating of Poetry: A Collaborative Approach

<b>Sundas Shabeer</b>	MS English Linguistics, Foundation University Islamabad. Email: <a href="mailto:sundasshabeer543@gmail.com">sundasshabeer543@gmail.com</a>
<b>Zohaib ur Rehman</b>	MS English Linguistics, Foundation University Islamabad. Email: <a href="mailto:zohaiburrehman119@gmail.com">zohaiburrehman119@gmail.com</a>
<b>Muhammad Idrees</b>	MS English Linguistics, Foundation University Islamabad. Email: <a href="mailto:seii32@yahoo.com">seii32@yahoo.com</a>

### Abstract

The application of collaborative approach has investigated as a literary genre to the students speaking Urdu in this study. The approach used in this study is applied to the translation of Robert Frost's Stopping by Woods on a Snowy Evening into Urdu language. A group of students from different colleges are taken as participants in order to see the effectiveness of this approach. ACNCS criteria is also used additionally to assess the translated text's quality in conveying the meaning in the target text as given in the source text. Results and qualitative analysis of the study concludes in improving the results by using the collaborative approach. Albeit, some limitations are there in this approach, but it can be used by other teachers in teaching literary texts as well as non-literary texts.

**Keywords:** Translation, collaborative approach, source text, target text, poetry

### INTRODUCTION

In education, in an ESP setting, the term "collaboration" was used first, when subject and language specialists collaborate in a classroom. "The direct working together of the language teacher and the subject teacher inside and/or outside the classroom in order that they prepare students to carry out particular tasks or courses" in an ESP environment is defined by Dudley-Evans and St John (p.44). Lessons are prepared and presented in classroom by them. Here language teachers play a crucial role by presenting the subject matter of the text and cover the topics linguistically. Subject teachers also handle the difficult details while explaining the material in classes. Another name for this type of cooperation is "Team teaching."

Initially Grammar Translation Method (GTM) was widely used in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century in classrooms, translation has been used as a teaching and learning tool for English. This approach involved learning word lists along with their target language equivalents (Cook, 2003).

When writers, publishers, translation firms, and translators work together to create a translation, this is referred to as collaboration in translation. More precisely, it describes the collaboration of two or more individuals to create a translation. Naturally, this might occur in a variety of contexts, including educational classrooms and the community (Pochhacker, 2004). This paper focuses on the latter.

Furthermore, Andre Guyon says that "collaborative translation is done by a group of individuals working together where coordination and discussions between participants are part and parcel of the translation process," (p. 33). He notes that "using today's web-based tools in collaborative translation could enable translators to share a text of unlimited length among unlimited number of translators and revisers" (Ibid) while weighing the benefits and drawbacks of online translation using collaborative approach.

Additionally, Ishida (2012) suggest a system named automated multilingual system of the multilingual discussions for the collaboration translation in different languages used for translation on Wikipedia etc in the paper "*Supporting Multilingual Discussion for Collaborative Translation.*"

Desilets addresses the social networking impact with collaborative technologies used in translation in her paper "*Wanted: Best Practices for Collaborative Translation.*" She also discusses a number of collaborative technology applications in translation, including various markets for translators such as online and others, crowdsourcing, and translation memory sharing.

She also notes that the primary contexts in which collaborative translation is used by people, translators, and those who provided services are business groups. In such a setting, a group of qualified translators can regulate the quality of the translation through a voting process, mutual revision, and suitable management.

"The presence of a compelling incentive for member of the group or crowd to participate" is a crucial component of a successful collaborative translation effort. Problems with motivation are particularly important in crowd-sourcing situations. (ibid, p.4). To guarantee that translated material is of a professional caliber, the roles of the language teacher and the professional subject-matter instructor should be effectively performed in collaborative translation. By editing and reviewing the finished output, they can do this.

Al-Shabab (1998) categorized the methods used to teach translation to college students who speak Urdu into various groups i.e (1) Model of ready made translated texts, (2) Model of grammatical structure, and (3) the dynamic model. He also proposes a Textual Manipulation approach that addresses three facets of teaching translation in general: "Textual manipulation, creating context; Textual manipulation, paraphrasing; and Textual manipulation: addition and omission of information." This approach is an alternative to Hermeneutic approaches to translation studies as the methods used in both the models are different (Herman, 2011).

He didn't seem to mention teamwork as a possible translation instruction strategy that may be applied in a classroom with kids who speak Urdu.

"There is no universal canon according to which texts may be assessed," notes Bassnett (1980/2014, p. 21), in reference to the problem of evaluating translated texts. Each book participates in an ongoing dialectical connection with other sets of canons, and entire sets of canons are subject to change and shift.

Susan Bassnett provides in *"On Translation Studies"* a precise overview of the criteria governing poetry and its translation. She starts with a structural approach, in which the translator's criteria are based on the lexical and surface structures of the version of the source text (ST). She also discusses the seven different strategies provided by Andre Lefevere (1975), including phonological (phonemic) translation, literal (word to word) translation, metrical (line to line) translation, paraphrasing (prose), rhythmic translation, blank verse translation and others like interpretation of the poem, length of the poem, shape (sonnet etc), organization of line(s), and poet's tone while translating poetry, and translation used in discourses which analysis tone in conversation and modality over interpretation of the poem and translation fidelity (faithfulness).

Furthermore, criteria such as "accuracy" by Bassnett, "clarity" by Fadaee, "naturalness" by Newmark, and "communicative purpose" by Nord have been widely used in the evaluation of literary translations in poetry and in other subjects as well. Poetry uses all these criteria in particular while other subjects see all these in general. To ensure the primary goal and message of our translation, there are some limitations we must consider when translating any literary work. Furthermore, our translated text (TT) wouldn't seem odd or unrelated. These limitations can be stated as standards or a checklist that we can always consult while working on the translation process and final product. Appendix A below lists them in order of significance.

While translating literary texts, a creative translator must be aware of all the limitations and strictness that such texts hold to the theoretical approaches used in translation in general. Different theorists and linguists such as Roman Jakobson, Vinay and Darbelnet, Eugene Nida, Newmark and Catford came forward with their procedures in order to handle the ST and TT together while doing translation. Poetry is different and its translation needs an understanding of the culture of the ST and TT also along with the context of the ST and situation and purpose of its translation in the TT.

A collaborative approach could be a good way to investigate teaching poetry translation to Urdu-speaking students because it would allow the students to work at their own pace without worrying about teacher criticism. With this method, we as translation instructors could evaluate and analysis that how translators employ the important tools and collaborative abilities to comprehend, interpret, and apply the different criteria to analyse the translation purpose and intuition.

Our interest as learners of translation and the allusion provided above, we are passionate to use a method of collaborative teaching to translation that is having some limitations of cultural and stylistic conventions imposed by the ST. In simple words, if a

collaborative approach does not induce any changes to the meaning of any of the primary cultural and other requirements like stylistics, grammatical, categories etc for translating poetry, it is acceptable; if it does, it is rejected. The translated text must attain maximal approximation in equivalency and communicate the text's message in a suitable manner without compromising any of the poem's artistic or cultural elements in order to produce an acceptable version of poetry in Urdu. We can simply say that if a ST text is leaving the same influence on the TT readers as it is having on the readers of the ST, implying the same cultural norms and values, then such translation is acceptable and can be taken as same as the ST.

There is no particular source or strategy used for translation of literary texts as these texts hold a lot of limitations like cultural limitations, context or situation, linguistics variables, nature of the readers of the TT etc. If a translator is going to translate the Shakespeare's poetry and dramas for today's readers, it will leave an impact on the target text readers but it will not effect the readers as effected in the Shakespearean time.

Translation of a literary text from a source text to a target text, taking all the considerations of culture, context, situation and values while maintaining the highest levels of spirit, fidelity and truth of the original text is referred to as "creative translation" in this context (henceforth ACNCS criteria). Katherina Reiss says that such type of translation came under "Expressive Texts" in which the author uses the aesthetic dimension of language. In these translation(s), the author or sender is foregrounded. In order to accomplish this difficult task, the creative translator must consider the previously mentioned ACNCS criteria as the primary guidelines that will direct him or her in processing and producing a literary text that is correct, seems original and appropriate imaginatively and aesthetically.

### **RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

To find out how employing a collaborative teaching approach affected the students' level of translations of a Source text (English) poetry, the following question was put forward.

Does the quality of Urdu-speaking students' translations of English poetry in college improve when translation is taught collaboratively?

### **METHODOLOGY**

The purpose of this study was to find out how well "collaboration" works as a teaching strategy to assist students in producing higher-quality translations of English poetry into Urdu.

Following organized teaching in a team by the authors, students (male and female) and an expert of Urdu language worked together to translate Frost's "Stopping by Woods on a Snowy Evening" into Urdu in order to accomplish this goal. A five-point rating system was then used to analyse the students translated text such as excellent, good, average, bad, and very bade. A bilingual and bicultural instructor and a MALS assessed the translated students' texts using ACNCS criteria because the data is in two languages.

It has been assumed throughout this study that the participants are reasonably proficient users of Standard Urdu (SU) and that they utilize Urdu in written and ordinary communication. However, Urdu and English were the languages of instruction in the classroom.



## **PARTICIPANTS**

The participants in this study were 45 female undergraduate English Language and Literature majors from Federal Urdu University. Three groups of three people each were formed out of them. All of the participants are native speakers of Urdu, and the aim of the students was to translate the provided materials from the source text (English) into the target text (Urdu). These seventh-semester students had already completed all prerequisites for the three-year-long Creative Translation Course, which consists of one term with a hour session per week for three weeks. The groups ranges from 12 to 15 students in size, and the authors proposed and provided the materials used in the course of translation. In general, all the students were almost at the same level in considering the principles, guidelines, practical basis, and theoretical basis in translation.

## **EVALUATORS**

The authors are well-versed in Urdu and English while teaching and analyzing both the subjects in different institutions. They worked in a team and evaluated the texts produced by the students using ACNCS criteria for truth, spirit and fidelity with the source text. The students translated the texts by their own using different approaches of translation that are taught to them during the classes.

## **EXPERIMENTAL GROUP ASSESSMENT**

Over the whole course, collaborative teaching approach or instruction was provided to the students in experimental group centered around poetry in order to equip them with the tools on the basis of which they can produce a creative and appropriate text. Main objective of the course was to equip the students with the approach of translating poetry in a creative manner rather than using literal approach. Students practiced the activity of translation in their class also in translating literary pieces in class at different points during the semester, including plays, short tales, and speeches, which are the main literary genres. Each lecture on creative translation lasted two hours.

While translating a literary work, like poetry, students were instructed to consider the following factors.

- 1) The ability or skill of appropriately translating the message (as it is reflected in the ST) of the source text into the target text is known as accuracy.
- 2) Intelligibility without requiring the reader of the TT to use or make any cognitive abilities in comprehending the meaning of the TT is referred to as clarity in translation.
- 3) The skill of implying the same cultural values and norms of the ST in the TT in order to analyse "naturalness" in the translation.
- 4) Poetic translation in poetry means to convey the message of the ST in the target reader, as faithfully and successfully as possible, both the meaning and the emotional elements of the source text as they are originally conveyed to the ST audience.
- 5) In literary writings, "style" refers to the linguistic strategies the author employs to tell a story, depict things, characters, and events, or to express ideas and opinions in any way the author chooses such as archaic words, formal or informal language and colloquial words etc.

### **CONTROL GROUP ASSESSMENT**

Instruction to the control group was the same as that of translation classes at Urdu University generally, where collaboration and cooperation with Urdu language experts would not be requested. Rather, the instructor would select a literary work—in our example, a poem and its translation by the students at home before bringing it for discussing in the class. Here, instructor serves as the main authority for evaluating the translation of the students.

### **MATERIALS USED FOR TRANSLATION**

Robert Frost's poem was selected and given to the students in order to translate it from source text (English) into the target text (Urdu) once three weeks of poetry transactions were over and after a number of short English poems had been reviewed and considered. Frost's "Stopping by Woods on a Snowy Evening" was the poem. This was a new poem for the students and it was also there in the course (Language and Literature) of the students.

After reading Frost's poem, the class reviewed and clarified some of its more challenging vocabulary. Individual explanations, evaluations and interpretations of the poem were taught and shared with all participants, and numerous conversations were held regarding various aspects (cultural, stylistics and linguistics) of the poem. The researcher found that doing this with the entire class and discussing their opinions with them was important because it would lessen the challenges the participants would face and improve their readiness to accurately comprehend and interpret the poem's mood and spirit, which will then allow them to recreate in Urdu the feelings and emotions that are present in the original version of the poem.

### **COLLABORATIVE APPROACH'S PROCEDURE**

The groups (Experimental and Controlled Groups) were given the task of translation to complete the task as an assignment, giving them enough time to focus on it without being constrained by classroom rules. However, the members of the control group worked alone, whereas the members of the experimental group collaborated in groups of three.

Control Group participants completed the task in the next week when it was given to the group and then brought it for discussion and also for evaluating the translation in the class. The other group (Experimental group) also brought their translated poem in the class. Both the versions of the poem were analyzed and evaluated. Interpretation and understanding of the poem were taught in the classes to both the groups. Here the teacher or the instructor serves as the primary authority in the class and during the activity of translation.

The three members of the example collaborative group told the researcher that their cooperation included exchanging the translated text among themselves in addition to first comprehending, interpreting, and discussing the source text. Put differently, the initial draft was created by student A in the group, and the other two came with new ways of comprehending it. After then, student B responsibility was to take the draft that student A had proposed the draft and worked for a while to make it better while attempting to stay as close to the original wording as possible. The second draft was then picked up by Student C, who added her last artistic touches to the translated text. They got together once more to approve the translated text's final draft following this rigorous joint effort. After submitting this final copy to

the Urdu Language Specialist for assessment, the teacher and the participants worked together to add his poetic touches, elevating the translation to a level of imaginative poetry by transforming it into an Urdu Frost poem.

### **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

A two-stage approach is suggested by David Pendlebury (2005, p. 15), in which the participants (Experimental and Controlled Group) "produces a draft translation of the original that is as literal and accurate as possible." This draft is then translated by him "this draft, with only minimal reference to the original." This draft is referred by him as a "weaning away" from the version of the source text. The process of translating poetry is extremely complex; as it could "dismantle the original poem and build" a target text from the source text, and others can describe it that it "make a close reading and writing of the source text" and also to be faithful in the translation (p. 196). Though there appear to be a variety of approaches to translating poetry, it is reasonable to assume that the majority of translators strive to produce a translation that functions as appropriately and faithfully to the version of the source text and the target text reflect all the ideas given in the ST.

This discussion compares two Urdu translations of the poem—one by Ravi Kopra and the other by W.W. Freillman. Both translations aim to render the essence of Frost's work into Urdu, using interlingual translation as their primary method. However, the differences in word choice, imagery, cultural adaptation, and poetic style create unique outcomes. Below, we examine the similarities and differences in the two translations across several dimensions.

### **WORD CHOICE AND IMAGERY**

- Ravi Kopra's Translation:
- Ravi Kopra uses phrases like "رُہی ک کھیت" (fields of trees) for "woods." This cultural adaptation makes the imagery more relatable to an Urdu-speaking audience familiar with agrarian settings.
- Some poetic elements are simplified, as in "برف بھرے کھیتوں" (snow-filled fields) for "woods fill up with snow," shifting focus from the process to the result.
- The translation adds phrases like "ے شمار ہڑں" (innumerable) in "The woods are lovely, dark, and deep," introducing new layers not present in the original.
- W.W. Freillman's Translation:
- Freillman remains closer to the original in terms of imagery, using "جنگل" (woods) for "woods" and retaining the idea of "darkness" and "depth" without additional interpretations.
- Freillman focuses on literal accuracy but occasionally omits nuanced cultural adaptations that might resonate more with Urdu readers.
- Phrases like "منجمد جھیل" (frozen lake) directly capture the original's specificity, unlike Ravi Kopra's omission of "frozen."

### **TONE AND POETIC RHYTHM**

- Ravi Kopra:



- The tone in Ravi Kopra's translation leans toward narrative storytelling. It often elaborates on the original lines, such as "وہ گھنٹی بجا کر وچھتا ہے کہ م ٹ کس لیٹ م ٹ ڑا ہوں" (He rings the bell to ask what mistake I am caught in) for "To ask if there is some mistake."
- Repetition is reduced in key lines, such as "And miles to go before I sleep," where the second repetition is omitted, impacting the original's meditative rhythm.
- W.W. Freillman:
- Freillman retains the original's meditative tone by staying closer to the concise and repetitive structure. For instance, the repetition of "And miles to go before I sleep" is preserved, maintaining the reflective quality of the poem.
- The translation attempts to balance poetic rhythm with literal meaning, keeping the flow intact.

#### **CULTURAL ADAPTATION**

- Ravi Kopra:
- Ravi Kopra frequently adapts cultural elements, replacing "farmhouse" with "گھر" (house) and adding phrases like "گھوڑے ر" (on the horse) for clarity. These adaptations make the text more relatable but deviate slightly from the original's universal tone.
- The addition of descriptors like "بڑی ال رات" (biggest dark night) for "darkest evening" introduces cultural emphasis on grandeur.
- W.W. Freillman:
- Freillman avoids overt cultural adaptation, preserving the universality of the imagery. For example, "darkest evening" is directly translated as "سب س تاریک شام," retaining the focus on darkness rather than scale.
- The translation stays faithful to the original without embellishing or localizing the imagery.

#### **METHODS OF TRANSLATION**

Both translations primarily use interlingual translation, but their approaches differ in execution:

- Ravi Kopra:
- Uses a dynamic equivalence approach, focusing on the meaning and relatability of the text. This method sacrifices some of the original's specificity for broader accessibility.
- Occasionally leans toward interpretive translation, as seen in the elaboration of "To ask if there is some mistake."
- W.W. Freillman:
- Employs a formal equivalence approach, emphasizing fidelity to the source text.

This method retains the structure and meaning but sometimes lacks the cultural nuances found in Kopra's version.

#### **STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES**

Aspect Ravi Kopra W.W. Freillman

Imagery Relatable, culturally adapted imagery (e.g., fields) Closer to original imagery (e.g., woods, frozen lake)

Poetic Rhythm Simplified, with some omitted repetitions Retains the original's rhythm and repetition  
 Cultural Adaptation Accessible to Urdu readers, but less universal Faithful to the original, but less culturally localized  
 Translation Method Dynamic equivalence with interpretive elements Formal equivalence, focusing on literal meaning  
 Reader Impact Engages Urdu readers with relatable language Preserves Frost's meditative tone for universal readers

English (Source Text)	Urdu Translation (Target text)	Translation type
1. Whose woods these are I think I know.	یہ جنگل کس کا ہے مڑا خیال ہے مڑا جاننا ہوں	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
This line categorizes as an interlingual translation. The meaning and structure are transferred directly into Urdu, keeping the sentence nearly identical in both languages. The phrase "whose woods these are" directly transfer into Urdu with equivalence "جنگل کس کا ہے", which directly translates to source text. The sentence structure in the target text translation mirrors the source text. Both sentences start by interrogation and both fabricated in a way that make the speaker's uncertainty clear. The translation maintain the real essence of the source text without altering its meaning and tone.		
2. His house is in the village though;	اگر چہ اس کا گھر گاؤں میں ہے	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
This line also goes under interlingual translation translate the same message directly without any significant change. The source text word "his" translates into Urdu as "اس کا" clearly denoting possession and sustaining the link between "the house" and its owner. The structure of the source text directly transferred into Urdu. The conjunction "though" translated into Urdu as "اگر چہ" carries the same contrasting tone. The term "گاؤں" translates "village," while "گھر" conveys "house", maintains semantic accuracy. The peaceful and reflective tone of the poem is enhanced by the subtle suggestion in both the original language and the translation that the owner, who is in the village, is cut off from the present situation in the woods.		
3. He will not see me stopping here	وہ مجھے یہاں رکتا ہوا نہ دیکھے گا	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
The translation of this sentence directly transfer meaning without altering the original essence of the source text. The translation ensuring fidelity by translating each element of the source text into target text. English sentence follows structure SVO, the Urdu translation reflects source text structure. The third person singular used in English "He" is translated into Urdu as "وہ" accommodating reference. The future tense used in original text "will not see" translated		

as "نه ٿي ڏيکھي ٿي", retaining the accuracy of original text. The participial phrase "stopping" is translated as "رکنا ٿي", which match with the continuous attitude in Urdu. The reflective tone of the source text is retain in target text. The translation is smooth and naturally integrates into Urdu. The use of "نه ٿي" (not) and "گا" (future tense marker) ensures grammatical correctness and effectively communicates the intended message.

4. To watch his woods fill up with snow.	اور نه ه انا برف س ٻهرا ٻوڙا جنگل ڏيکھي آ ٿي ٿي.	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--	---	--

The original line conveys the experience of watching the woods being covered in snow. The target text translation captures this meaning efficaciously, with "ڏيکھي آ ٿي ٿي" translating "to watch" and "برف س ٻهرا ٻوڙا جنگل" referring to "his woods being filled with snow." The imagery, tone, and essence of the original text are maintained, with an added emphasis on negation to improve clarity in the target language. This approach ensures that the translation remains authentic to the original while being organically expressive in Urdu.

5. My little horse must think it queer	مڙي ڇهون ٿي س گهوڙي ڪو ٻڙا عجيب لگتا ٿي	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--	--	--

The translation of "My little horse must think it queer" follows the interlingual translation method by transferring the meaning straight from source text to target text while making little structural changes to suit Urdu syntax and idiomatic expression. The English sentence follows sentence structure SVO and the Urdu translation adjust to "مڙي ڇهون ٿي س گهوڙي ڪو" (my little horse) + "عجيب لگتا ٿي" (it queer). This reflects the SOV (Subject-Object-Verb) order of Urdu while maintaining the original essence. The translation stays true to the original text while being organically expressive in the target tongue because to the successful preservation of the line's tone, imagery, and humorous anthropomorphism.

6. To stop without a farmhouse near	جنگل ڪ پاس فارم ٻاؤس ڪ بغ ٿي رکنا	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
-------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	--

The source text sentence conveys the action of stopping in a place where there is no farmhouse nearby. By immediately translating the terms "stopping" and "without a farmhouse" into Urdu, the translation effectively conveys this notion. "بغ ٿي ڪ ٻاؤس فارم" literally translates "without a farmhouse," although "رکنا" means "to stop," though it reflect small deviation in meaning, as "رکنا" generally implies "to stay or keep", rather than a brief pause. Though it adds useful context, the addition of "جنگل ڪ پاس" significantly deviates from the original's simplicity, and the choice of "رکنا" introduces a small shift in tone. Although the translation is accurate overall, it may be improved for more tonal and semantic precision.

7. Between the woods and frozen lake	جنگل اور منجمد جهيل ڪ درميان	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--------------------------------------	---------------------------------	--

Interlingual method of translation is used in the sentence translation. The target text without any change directly translate each word with equivalence as in source sentence "Between the woods and frozen lake" is directly translated "جنگل اور منجمد جهيل ڪ درميان". The source text words directly translated into Urdu as "woods" as "جنگل", and "Frozen lake" as "منجمد جهيل" to

create simplicity of the source text and contain imagery. The Urdu translation maintained sentence structure and tone of the English phrase effectively, resulting in a organic and evocative translation.

8. The darkest evening of the year	سال ک تاریک ترین شام	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
------------------------------------	----------------------	--

The sentence is a case of interlingual translation in which Urdu translation maintains original essence of the source text. In English a specific evening defines by its darkness, implying both accurate and symbolic significance. The Urdu translation "سال ک تاریک ترین شام" literally captures this description. "The darkest evening" is rendered as "تاریک ترین شام", with "تاریک ترین" meaning "the darkest" and fabricating the superlative form of the adjective. In Urdu "Of the year" is translated as "سال ک", which is accurate and idiomatic expression of possession embed. The target text directly follows the sentence structure of the source text as in source text "The darkest evening", + "of the year." and in target text "سال ک", + "تاریک ترین شام". "تاریک ترین شام تاریک" (the darkest evening). This arrangement establish fidelity to the source text sentence's grammar. Overall the target text embed the original essence of the source text, which is grammatically and idiomatically understandable in Urdu .

9. He gives his harness bells a shake	وہ اے ساز ک گھنٹیوں کو زور س ہلتا اے	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
---------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	--

Interlingual translation method is used in this translated sentence, where the meaning is directly transferred from source text to target text with little structural adjustments to uniform the target language. The target text effectively conveys meaning of this sentence "He gives his harness bells a shake" as "اے ساز ک گھنٹیوں کو زور س ہلتا اے", and the source text construes the action of shaking the harness bells, a little yet vivid part of the poem. Sentence structures of English is SVO, the Urdu translation reorder this marginally to fit the natural word arrangement of Urdu. The original essence of the source text is kept , but the word "ساز" offers a metaphorical layer not explicitly present in the source text. The sentence arouses a tactile and auditory image of the harness bells shaking, adding to the sensory experience of the poem.

10. To ask if there is some mistake	یہ وجہی ک لے کہ آیا یہاں رکنا ہماری کوی لبط تو نہ ژں	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
-------------------------------------	--	--

Interlingual translation method has been used in the whole poem .The target text transmits original meaning of the source text with little variation of meaning based adjustment to boost clarity.

In the target text the phrase "یہاں رکنا" add for contextual clarity, clarifying the action under question. This addition make of the phrase make it clear and understandable for target text audience. The source text tone effectively mirrors same into target text. Some variations remove original essence somehow of the source text.

11. The only other sound's the sweep	اور آئے وال مزید آوازیں تو بس	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
The translation of source text sentence "The only other sound's the sweep" into " اور آئے وال " is an example of interlingual translation method.the meaning is transfers through some interpretive and structural modifications such as the Urdu translation " اور آئے وال " "مزید آوازیں تو بس" transmits the idea of "other sounds" but depart slightly in its interpretation. It proposes "آئے وال" (incoming) and "مزید" (additional), which are not explicitly mention in the sentence of the source text. Target text restructures the structure of the source text by adding " اور آئے وال مزید آوازیں تو بس" this add interpretive elements adapts the concise tone of the source text.		
12. Of easy wind and downy flake,	میک ہوا ک چپے اور برف ک نرم گالوں نگرے ک ہ ژں	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
In this case, the interlingual translation type also transfer direct meaning from source text to target text. In English sentence conjures tranquil image of a gentle wind ("easy wind") and soft snowflakes ("downy flake") directly transmit this sensory imagery into target text ( میک ہوا ک "چپے اور برف ک نرم گالوں ک گرے"). The addition of verb "چپے" and "نگرے" strengthen the imagery of the wind and snowflakes , makes the scene more vivid and dynamic for target audience.		
13. The woods are lovely, dark and deep	یہ جنگل خوبصورت، سیاہ اور گہرے ہ ژں	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
In this case, the interlingual translation type also transfer original essence of the source text into target text with minor adjustment such as interpretative and linguistic. The source text structure change by adding the adjectives in Urdu "خوبصورت، سیاہ اور گہرے" after "یہ جنگل" to maintained tone, sequence and description.		
14. But I have promises to keep	لیکن مجھے وعدے ورے کرے ہ ژں	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
This case also used interlingual translation type to transmit message directly with minor structural modifications.The source text shows obligation and responsibility to keep promises directly transfers into Urdu same obligation and responsibility to keep promises. The word "ہ ژں" is added for grammatical correctness in Urdu.The meaning is convey directly while maintaining tone and imagery for target text audience understanding . The translation is exact and flows naturally in Urdu, even though it slightly extends the original framework while preserving the essential feeling of accountability and dedication.		
15. And miles to go before I sleep,	اور مجھے سوے س ہل میوں دور جانا -ے	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
16. And miles to go before I sleep,	اور مجھے سوے س ہل میوں دور جانا -ے	
The translation used interlingual method directly transfers the meaning of the source text into target text, preserving the structure, tone, and repetition of the original.It is a powerful and		



successful translation for Urdu readers since it naturally and clearly captures the feeling of an unending trip and an incomplete task.

(Source Text):

Stopping by Woods on a Snowy Evening by Robert Frost

(Target Text):

**Urdu translation Ravi Kopra**

English (Source Text)	Urdu Translation (Target text)	Translation type
1. Whose woods these are I think I know.	یہ کس کی زبوں ککھیت ہوں، مجھے تہ ہے۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
Interlingual translation method is used. Meaning is transferred with minor alteration in imagery as in English "woods" translated into Urdu as "ککھیت ک زبوں" which changes the original imagery. The English word "woods" refers to wilderness which sets the tone of the poem and also the solitude theme. In the target text translated word "ککھیت ک زبوں" refers to the agriculture image losing the sense of wilderness and introduces cultural adaptation to make a more relatable image for the target text audience. Urdu translation also diminish original tone of the source text by using word "ککھیت", so this imagery alteration change original image of the line.		
2. His house is in the village though;	وہ گاؤں م زں ریتا ہے۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
The meaning transfers source text to target text using the Interlingual method with minor omission. In English, the word "though" is used for contrast to the previous line but in the Urdu translation "though" is omitted which changes the tone of the sentence. Urdu translation became straightforward by removing "though" and it also removed poetic flow. Urdu translation removes the layered emotion and poetic element embedded in the source text and makes translation straightforward.		
3. He will not see me stopping here	اس کو تہ نہ زں چل گا کہ م زں یہاں گھوڑے ر را ہوا ہوں۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
The source text sentence is concise and uses the phrase "stopping here", but the translation of Urdu "ہوں ہوا را ر گھوڑے یہاں" add "ر گھوڑے" in target text to make the imagery more vivid. The translation of the phrase "He will not see me" is translated into Urdu "گا چل نہ زں تہ کو اس" changes the meaning of "see" which refers to "دیکھنا" in Urdu translator removes the original essence of the poem by shifting tone reflective to descriptive.		
4. To watch his woods fill up with snow.	دیکھ رہا ہوں اس ک برف بھرے کھیتوں کو۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
The translation shifts the meaning but with alteration of meaning such as the word "wood" which mean "جنگل" but translates "کھیت" (field) instead of woods it change setting of the poem untamed wood change into cultivated fields. The target text translation shows static and		

culturally adaptive image rather than trans-formative process. The source text use reflective and meditative tone but target text translation make it descriptive. Urdu translation resonate it with south Asian rural landscape.

5. My little horse must think it queer	مڑا چھوٹا سا گھوڑا سوچتا ہے کہ یہ کیا عجیب بات ہے	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--	--	---

Translation directly conveys meaning but with minor addition. English word "queer" translates into Urdu "عجیب بات" which elaborates cultural adaptation and putting focus on the strangeness of the situation. English used puzzled reflection by the horse but translation makes the horse thought clear and verbalized. Translation changes poetic tone of the source text into conversational tone. While the translation conveys message effectively to the target audience.

6. To stop without a farmhouse near	مڑں یہاں راا ہوا ہوں جہاں کوی بھ گھر نہ ڑں۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
-------------------------------------	--	---

Same in this line translator alter imagery and tone by putting explanatory words. The translation of the line "To stop without a farmhouse near" as "مڑں یہاں راا ہوا ہوں جہاں کوی بھ" changes the original essence of the line by adding explanatory tone. The replacement of the farmhouse with "کوی بھ گھر" change the meaning of the source line. In Urdu the addition of the phrase "مڑں یہاں راا ہوا ہوں" makes explanatory tone which change the simplicity of the original text. The whole alteration change the tone poetic to explanatory, pastoral setting to isolated imagery, and concise text to explanatory text.

7. Between the woods and frozen lake	ان ڑیوں ک کھیتوں اور جھیل ک بیج۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--------------------------------------	-------------------------------------	---

In this line again translator translate "woods" into "ڑیوں ک کھیتوں" which change the close meaning and alter the sense of natural seclusion of the source text. It provides functional equivalent but removing original essence of the source text. In the source line word "frozen" adds for vividness and describing the lake but in Urdu translation it is omits which removes the vividness of the scene. Urdu translation does not evoke the same depth of meaning by omitting "frozen".

8. The darkest evening of the year.	سال ک سب س بڑی ال رات ہے۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
-------------------------------------	------------------------------	---

The Urdu translation captures the general idea of the source line by adding detail explanation of the word darkest. English word "darkest" translate into Urdu as "سب س بڑی" which shifts the original meaning and changes descriptive detail into dramatic detail. The word "Evening" translate into Urdu as "رات" it omits the original meaning of the evening, which lies between day and night. It simplifies the imagery making it less specific. While the Urdu translation conveys the general idea with the additional elements.

9. He gives his harness bells a shake	وہ ساز و سامان کو ہلتا ہے۔	Interlingual translation method (Interpretative translation)
---------------------------------------	----------------------------	---

The translation of this line removes the original essence by translating "harness bells" into

Urdu as "ساز و سامان". In English "harness bells" refers specifically to the bells attached to the harness of a horse but translation removes the specific reference to the bells. The Urdu translation removes the auditory effect of the phrase "harness bells a shake". The translation removes the specificity of the original text.

10. To ask if there is some mistake.	اور گھنٹی بجا کر وجہنا ہے کہ مڑن کس لپیٹ مڑن رٹا ہوں۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--------------------------------------	--	---

Interlingual translation method used along with interpretative elements. The English line is quite simple but translated version introduces interpretative shifts by adding phrase "کسلیٹ" which is not explicitly mentioned in the source text. The English line is simple just asking if there is some mistake but Urdu translation make it dramatic. It changes the original tone by using interpretative method of translation. However addition make it more effective but diminish the original meaning of the source text.

11. The only other sound's the sweep	گھنٹی اور دھڑپے دھڑپے جی تے ہوا۔	Interlingual translation method (with simplification)
--------------------------------------	-------------------------------------	--

The translation diminish the auditory imagery. English word "sweep" translated as "ہوا دھڑپے" (slow moving wind). The original word "sweep" refers to the soft sweeping sound of the wind but Urdu translation simplifies the imagery to just the description of the wind movement. The source line carries a specific smooth rhythm and tone but translation changes smooth flow of rhythm and less auditory tone.

12. Of easy wind and downy flake.	اور کوملگر تے برف ک آواز۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
-----------------------------------	---------------------------	---

The translation rephrase the source text with minor addition such as "ک آواز", which is not explicitly mention in the original text. The addition introduces more depth and create slight disruption in the tone. The addition makes line more explanatory and embed auditory imagery. The original phrase "downy flake" refers to fluffy nature of snowflakes

But the Urdu translation "کومل گر تے برف" refers to general description of falling snow which move attention to individual flake. In the original there is no sound mentioned but Urdu translation introduce auditory perception. The translation adds more depth but departs original essence.

13. The woods are lovely, dark and deep,	یہ رُپ خوبصورت ہوں، ال ال س ہوں، اے شمار ہوں۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
--	--	---

The translation maintained some original meaning but introduces notable shifts. The word choice in English "lovely", "dark" and "deep", translated into Urdu as "خوبصورت", "ال ال", "س ہوں" these adjectives shows rhythmic tone but translation make sit descriptive. The addition of "اے شمار ہوں" makes descriptive which affect on the flow of the original line. The translation departs from the original meaning of the source text by conveying beauty and majesty of nature which is not detailed mention in the original text.

14. But I have promises	لیکن مجھے دے ہوئے وعدے	Interlingual translation method
-------------------------	------------------------	---------------------------------

to keep,	ورے کرے ہوں۔	(direct translation)
<p>Like as in the the whole poem translator added something same in this sentence added the word "دے ہوے" which change the tone of the original text.Overall message preserved</p> <p>But the addition shifts the focus from a general commitment to more specific sense of obligation.The word “keep” translated as "ورے کرے ہوں" keep is verb which mean to uphold but Urdu translation focus on the action of completing which alter original meaning.The original line create sense of responsibility and translation creates more concrete sense of obligation.The shifts change the tone poetic to more concrete.The shifts provide a more detailed but translation still convey main idea of the original text.</p>		
15. And miles to go before I sleep,	اور سوے س ہل بہت دور جانا ہے۔ اور سوے س ہل بہت دور جانا ہے۔	Interlingual translation method (direct translation)
16. And miles to go before I sleep,	ہے۔	
<p>Interlingual method used for translation, which conveys overall meaning of the original text but lose the poetic emphasis and repetition.The phrase of English such as “miles to go” translated as "بہت دور جانا ہے" coveys the direct meaning but solely the word “miles” translated as "بہت دور" miles carries a specific measurement of distance ,which is lost in translation.The meaning sightly change but still giving core idea of the sentence.</p>		

## CONCLUSION

Both translations achieve their purpose but cater to different audiences. Ravi Kopra's translation adapts the poem for cultural resonance, making it accessible to Urdu readers while occasionally sacrificing fidelity to the original. W.W. Freillman's version stays closer to the source text, preserving its universal imagery and poetic structure but with less cultural adaptation.

A blend of the two approaches—retaining Freillman's fidelity while incorporating Kopra's cultural sensitivity—could create an ideal translation that captures the spirit, tone, and relatability of Frost's work for Urdu readers.

This study demonstrated how students' translation quality improved as a result of the collaborative method. The experiment's findings demonstrate that the translated materials in both the version such as Ravi Kopra and that of Free Ilm versions were approved from the perspective of the Urdu Language Specialist and ranked according to "novelty and appropriateness" while considering the criteria of ACNCS in this study.

Both the teacher(s) and student(s) are seeking assistance from the specialist of Urdu language in their department in order to carry the task of translation as according to the original version of the source text ST. Here spirit, truth and fidelity are also analyzed in accordance with the ST. The TT produced by the participants as a result of collaborative approach play a vital role in enhancing the understanding of literary texts like poetry of the participants.

It is hoped that this method will be investigated and applied by those who are interested in translating not only poetry and other literary works in Urdu and English, but also other kinds of texts, like non-fiction, historical, newspapers, monologues, legal documents etc.

## REFERENCES

- Al-Shabab, O. S. (1998). *Translating with difference: Theory and Practice*. DEBS, Damascus, Syria.
- Cook, G. (2003). *Applied Linguistics*. Oxford University Press
- Desilets, A. (2011). Wanted: Best Practices for Collaborative Translation, *TAUS 2011*. Retrieved from <http://www.translationautomaion.com>
- Fadaee, E. (2011). Translation naturalness in literary works: English to Persian. *Internal Journal of English and Literature*, 2(9), 200-205.
- Guyon, A. (2010). *The Ups and Downs of Online Collaborative Translation*. TERMIUM Plus, Public Works and Government Services Canada 2014.
- Ishida, N., Lin, D., Takasaki, T., & Ishida, T. (2012). Supporting Multilingual Discussion for Collaborative Translation. IEEE, Department of Social Informatics, Kyoto University, Japan.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. Prentice Hall International (UK) Ltd.
- Nide, E. A. (2001). *Language, Culture and Translating*. Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
- Nord, C. (2006). Translating for Communicative Purposes across Culture Boundaries. *Journal of Translation Studies*, 9(1), 43-60.
- Pendlebury, D. (2005). *"Creative Translation"* Monograph Series No. 48, the Insitute of Cultural Research, Antony Row Ltd. Eastbourne, UK.
- Perteghella, M., & Loffedo, E. (2006). *Translation and Creativity*. New York and London: Continuum International Publishing.